

Implementation of PAI Learning Design in Developing Religious Tolerance in Public High Schools

Muhammad Anas Ma`arif¹, Siti Lailatul Muarofah² Godlif Sianipar³ Ahmad Hariyadi⁴ Shakila Kausar⁵

¹ Universitas KH. Abdul Chalim Mojokerto, Indonesia; anasdt16@gmail.com

² Universitas KH. Abdul Chalim Mojokerto, Indonesia; ar.rofah31@gmail.com

³ Universitas Katolik Santo Thomas Medan, Indonesia; Emailgodlif@yahoo.com

⁴ Universitas Muria Kudus, Indonesia; ahmad.hariyadi@umk.ac.id

⁵ Riphah International University Islamabad, Pakistan; shakilakauser5@outlook.com

Abstract

Keywords:

Implementation,
IRE Learning Design,
Religious Tolerance.

This article aims to describe and analyze the urgency and implementation of PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik. The research method used in this article is qualitative with a case study approach. Data collection techniques using interviews, observation, and documentation. The results of the research are that there are 3 stages in the implementation of PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, namely planning, implementation, and evaluation. This research can help increase students' understanding of other religions so that they are able to respect differences in beliefs. This research can provide learning experiences that can help students develop empathy towards individuals from various religious backgrounds. By understanding the values of tolerance, students can be better able to prevent religious discrimination in society. Religious tolerance education needs to be given to students as early as possible. Instilling openness of thought from an early age, and accepting differences based on the values of tolerance, will of course minimize attitudes of intolerance in students.

Abstrak

Kata kunci:

Implementasi,
Desain Pembelajaran
PAI,
Toleransi Beragama

Artikel ini bertujuan untuk mendeskripsikan dan menganalisis urgensi dan implementasi desain pembelajaran PAI dalam mengembangkan toleransi beragama di SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik. Metode penelitian yang digunakan dalam artikel ini adalah Kualitatif dengan pendekatan studi kasus. Teknik pengumpulan data dengan wawancara, observasi dan dokumentasi. Adapun hasil penelitian ialah Terdapat 3 tahap dalam Implementasi desain pembelajaran PAI dalam mengembangkan toleransi beragama di SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean yaitu perencanaan, pelaksanaan dan evaluasi. Penelitian ini dapat membantu meningkatkan pemahaman siswa tentang agama-agama lain, sehingga mereka mampu menghormati perbedaan keyakinan. Penelitian ini dapat memberikan pengalaman belajar yang dapat membantu siswa mengembangkan empati terhadap individu dari berbagai latar belakang keagamaan. Dengan memahami nilai-nilai toleransi, siswa dapat lebih mampu mencegah diskriminasi agama di masyarakat. Pendidikan toleransi beragama perlu diberikan kepada siswa sedini mungkin. Penanaman sejak dini tentang keterbukaan pemikiran, menerima perbedaan berlandaskan nilai-nilai toleransi, tentunya akan meminimalisir sikap intoleransi pada diri siswa.

Corresponding Author:

Muhammad Anas Ma`arif: Universitas KH. Abdul Chalim Mojokerto, Indonesia; anasdt16@gmail.com

INTRODUCTION

In the history of the Indonesian nation, plurality has given birth to beautiful collaborations in various forms of cultural culture that are thick with diversity. Various tribes, religions, races, customs, cultures, and groups can live side by side and have a very high room for negotiation in everyday life, which we know as tolerance (Anwar, 2021; Ok, Al-Farabi, & Firmansyah, 2022). However, the world was shaken by the tearing of the beauty of exclusive attitudes that grew from the roots of narrow primordialism of ethnicity, race, class, and religion, particularly in the form of conflict and terrorism (Amirudin, Ruswandi, Erihadiana, & Rohimah, 2022a; Ma`arif, 2019). Several issues of intolerance also often arise, starting from the boycott of several French products in Indonesia, and suicide bombings carried out by several irresponsible individuals, even several mass media in India reported that some people in India were openly carrying out actions (Rohmah, Rena, Pahrurraji, & Syarif, 2023; Sechandini, Ratna, Zakariyah, & Na'imah, 2023). Demonstration to boycott halal products in India, Indian people believe that the halal label is a form of discrimination against the Indian population, where the majority of the population adheres to the Hindu religion. Several existing issues of intolerance prove that attitudes toward tolerance in the world have experienced a decline (Romadlan, 2019).

Schools are an integrated part that plays an important role in instilling the values of tolerance in schools. Efforts to maintain harmony and culture between religious communities through religious education must be implemented and cultivated (Alawi & Maarif, 2021; Jayadi, Abduh, & Basri, 2022). Religious tolerance education is built with the aim of making students able to respond to and filter educational problems, including social issues in the school environment, society, and the country (Rofi'ah, 2018).

Religious tolerance education needs to be given to students as early as possible. Instilling openness of thought from an early age, accepting differences, and maintaining harmony, based on the values of tolerance can minimize attitudes of intolerance in students (Habermas, 2004; Nakaya, 2018). Moreover, in PAI learning in high school in grade 11, there is material about "Tolerance as a Tool for Unifying the Nation" in the even semester. A teacher should be able to explain the material well so that students can understand and practice it in real life (Fuadi, Nasution, & Wijaya, 2023; Raihani, 2012). Teachers are required to be creative in developing learning media so that students can be interested and enthusiastic in participating in PAI learning so that the material presented can be well absorbed (Halim, 2022).

Ni Putu Alit Wulandari, et al in their journal discussing forms of tolerance between religious communities in students, said that forms of tolerance education can be taught in schools through the form of curriculum and school policies, forms of social, cultural, and sports activities, forms of example, and forms of group learning (Ni Putu Alit Wulandari, I Gede Suwindia, 2019). Siti Nur Asiyah and Asrul Anan discuss in their journal that the patterns and processes of religious tolerance education are diverse and can be developed according to school needs. Khoirul Anwar and Munif also wrote in their journal in 2019 with the title "Strategy for Islamic Religious Education Teachers in

Building Religious Harmony Tolerance for Students" (Asiyah & Anan Asrul, 2021). The results of this research show that the teacher strategies used in theory are in accordance with the aspects that must be involved in building tolerance including: utilization of learning resources, preparation of selected materials, application of a variety of methods, implementation of continuous evaluation and can be applied in building tolerance, harmony among people. religion for students. There is no shortage of journals written by Khoirul Anwar and (Munif, 2019), however, from these aspects it would be good if a good PAI learning design emerged in building religious tolerance.

Of the many studies, there is not much research that examines PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance, even though PAI learning designs need and are urgent to be developed and researched so that learning can develop more creatively and innovatively, especially in PAI learning. Therefore, this article will discuss the implementation of PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik.

RESEARCH METHODS

To study in depth the implementation of PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, researchers used qualitative research. Qualitative research. Information obtained in the field is in the form of data in the form of written or spoken words, so this research is called qualitative research (Sugiyono, 2018). Meanwhile, the approach used in this research is a case study approach. The case study approach is used to collect and analyze data related to a case, both cases relating to problems, shortcomings as well as advantages and disadvantages in the case of institutions, society and others (Sukmadinata, 2005).

The aim of this researcher is to obtain information about implementing PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean. This research was carried out at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik. The reason the researcher chose this location is because implementing PAI learning designs like this is rarely implemented in other schools with different religious backgrounds. Apart from that, at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik, researchers can get easier and clearer information regarding implementing PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance. held.

The data collection techniques used in this research are observation, interviews and documentation. The observation used in this research is non-participant observation. This non-participant observation technique was used to search for data about the process of implementing PAI learning designs and evaluating the implementation of PAI learning designs at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean through independent observers conducted by researchers. The interviews conducted in this research were semi-structured. In this case the researcher asked several questions that were structured but not bound and could be developed more freely according to the topic being discussed. In this research, interviews were conducted directly with the informants, to obtain data on the planning, process and evaluation of PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance and the urgency of learning tolerance at SMA

Negeri 1 Kedamean. The informants who were the data sources were: School principal: Drs. Agus Setiawan, S.Pd, M.Pd, PAI subject teachers: Abdul Wahid, M.Pd.I., and Lukman Hakim, S.Pd.I, Class XI Science students: Siti Aisyah Vidiyansah (Islam), Laurentia Audrey (Catholic Christian), Alia Maurelita (Protestant Christian). Meanwhile, documentation techniques were used by researchers to record school profiles and data about PAI learning designs at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, especially teaching materials and teacher modules for eleventh grade PAI subjects at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

Implementation of PAI Learning Design in Developing Religious Tolerance

In this section we will discuss data on implementing PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik. Implementing the PAI learning design starts from the planning stage, at this stage it starts with determining the project and forming a project implementation team. This was also conveyed by the school principal, Mr. Agus Setiawan: "*The determination of the project and the formation of the project implementation team was attended by the entire board of teachers of SMA Negeri 1 Kecepatan, then it was decided by the project implementation team consisting of Mr. Mahrus, Abdul Wahid, Rahman and Lukman Hakim, as Religion teachers. at Peace 1 Public High School.*" (Agus Setiawan, Interview: Gresik, 14 November 2023).

This was reinforced by what was conveyed by Mr. Abdul Wahid as the head of the project implementer: "*Project implementation activities are carried out in three stages, including planning, implementation and evaluation, which begins with a coordination meeting to determine the project and the goals to be achieved.*" After determining the project to be implemented, the implementing team designs a learning design that has been mutually agreed upon. As stated by Mr. Lukman Hakim as the implementing team, he said that:

"The learning design designed has the theme I want to know in the form of group assignments, where each group is assigned to visit several religious figures around the community and around the school to find information about the diversity of religious groups and beliefs held by the surrounding community. After students have obtained some information through observations and interviews with several religious figures around them, they must write down the data they obtain in the form of a scientific work, namely a paper which must then be presented and discussed together in the Islamic Religious Education learning process regarding religious tolerance."

Mr. Abdul Wahid as the chief executive explained that the aim of holding PAI learning design is: "*As a way of providing more impressive PAI learning to children, sometimes children remember things they have experienced better than something they only learned from reading books.*"

Another aim of implementing PAI learning design was explained again by Mr. Abdul Wahid, he explained that:

"Teaching children to practice *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* cannot just be a theory. Teaching children an attitude of tolerance is not enough with just material, but being directly involved in analyzing data and determining attitudes is a goal that is expected to make students have an attitude of tolerance, living in harmony in diversity, mutually respecting and appreciating other people's opinions is called tolerance."

After the learning design is agreed upon, the teacher forms groups. This was also explained by Mr. Lukman Hakim as an Islamic Religious Education teacher in class 11 IPS, he said that:

"There are ten groups consisting of five science class groups, four social studies class groups, and one language class group. In each class, on average, there are 2 to 3 non-Muslim students. "This group activity aims to teach students an attitude of mutual respect and appreciation as well as clarifying the material on religious tolerance to grade 11 students directly by exploring data on several religious figures around the school and community environment."

Based on the results of an interview with the school principal, Mr. Agus Setiawan, he said that:

"There are 1047 students and 46 teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Kecepatan. Of all the teachers at SMA Negeri 1 Peace, the majority are Muslim, only two are Christians, while several students are non-Muslim. There are three religions adhered to by students at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, including Islam, the majority religion, and the other two religions adhered to are Catholic Christianity and Protestant Christianity. In each class, on average, there are 2 to 3 non-Muslim students."

However, through the results of observations made by researchers, researchers found that all students could live in harmony side by side, could help each other and work together. The efforts made by the school to instill and develop an attitude of religious tolerance between students of different religions are by creating PAI learning designs, carrying out several joint activities such as events at school which involve all school members.

The final stage of planning is making a report to the school head as approval for project activities. After the project activities are approved by the school principal, the teacher begins implementing the learning design in learning, in this case the PAI learning design. Based on the results of the interview with Mr. Abdul Wahid, he said that the implementation of the PAI learning design will start from May 8 2023 to May 15 2023 in chapter 6 of the even semester.

Meanwhile, in the process of implementing the PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, there are seven stages. Based on the results of an interview with Mr. Lukman Hakim, he said that the implementation process is as follows:

"First the teacher delivers learning material on religious tolerance, then explains the assignment to the students (observations and interviews with religious figures around the environment) followed by delivering group development, then the teacher explains the technicalities of writing scientific papers, after the students observe, interview and analyze the data the students are allowed to present the results findings in the field, then the teacher assesses and evaluates learning outcomes."

Meanwhile, in evaluating the application of PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, teachers carried out two forms of assessment as stated by Mr. Abdul Wahid.

"At the evaluation stage the teacher assesses the 3 aspects of cognitive, psychomotor and affective. Assessment is carried out through observation during the learning process and assessing students' work. There are two forms of assessment, namely group assessment and individual assessment. Group assessments are in the form of papers, and individual assessments are in the form of cognitive assessments and student attitude assessments."

Table 1. *Implementation of Tolerance-based PAI Learning Design*

Implementation of Tolerance-based PAI Learning Design	Activities carried out by teachers at school
Learning Planning	Determine the learning project and implementation team. Determining learning design Form a learning group to make a report on learning activities.
The process of implementing PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) the teacher delivers material related to religious tolerance in chapter 11 of the even semester 2) the teacher conveys the learning objectives to be achieved 3) the teacher conveys the learning design to students 4) the teacher conveys the group division 5) the teacher delivers the assignment 6) students analyze data through direct observation of community leaders based on instructions from the teacher 7) students present their findings and create a scientific work in the form of a paper based on the findings
Evaluation of tolerance-based learning	Evaluation or assessment. There are two assessments carried out, namely group assessment and individual assessment. The group assessments assessed are papers, while the individual assessments carried out are cognitive and attitudinal assessments.

Discussion

Implementation of PAI Learning Design in Developing Religious Tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean Gresik

Based on the presentation of research data, it was found that the results of implementing PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance carried out by SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean were carried out in three stages starting from planning, implementation to evaluation. This is in line with the theory put forward by Suherman, et al that in implementing implementation, learning management is required which consists of three stages, namely, planning, implementation and evaluation (Mulyasa, 2013).

In line with the theory put forward by (Amirudin, Ruswandi, Erihadiana, & Rohimah, 2022b; Apriliani & Justitia, 2021) regarding implementation in learning, which means the implementation and application of a plan that has been prepared in detail and thoroughly in implementing a learning process. Teaching design is a tool that can help teachers carry out learning activities effectively (Menon, Kars, Malhotra, Campbell, & van Delden, 2018). The aim of this religious tolerance learning design is to develop an attitude of tolerance and shape students' character in accordance with the objectives of the National Education System and to be able to fully interpret the philosophy of tolerance by staying in touch with certain religious figures (Nurbatra & Masyhud, 2022).

Good learning design will avoid monotonous and boring learning activities (Børte, Nesje, & Lillejord, 2023). Learning design can at least be an alternative for teachers in developing religious tolerance for students in high school (Álvarez, Jivet, Pérez-Sanagustín, Scheffel, & Verbert, 2022). Meanwhile, the core goal of being tolerant is to create harmony in society (Uyun & Warsah, 2022).

Planning for Implementation of Islamic Religious Education Learning Design

In the planning process for implementing PAI learning design, there are several processes including:

Determine the learning project

In the first stage, teachers consult to determine the learning project that will be used. There are seven project themes that can be designed in the MERDEKA curriculum, among the seven projects are: 1) Sustainable lifestyle, 2) Local wisdom, 3) Build your body and soul, 4) The voice of democracy, 5) Engineering and technology to build the Republic of Indonesia, 6) Entrepreneurship, 7) Unity in Diversity.

From the results of an interview with Mr. Agus Setiawan as the principal at SMA Negeri 1 Kecepatan it is known that:

"Ladies and gentlemen, the teachers' council needs to raise the theme of Bhinneka Tunggal Ika as an effort to instill the value of religious tolerance in students and prevent religious intolerance. He said that in the project to strengthen the profile of Pancasila students with the theme Bhinneka Tunggal Ika, students are invited to get to know and learn to build respectful dialogue about the diversity of religious groups and beliefs held by the surrounding community, especially in the community and in the school environment."

This is in accordance with Dick and Carey (Dick, 1996), educational technology experts who emphasize that learning design in general uses a systems approach consisting of problem analysis, design, development, implementation and evaluation. The initial step taken by the teacher in consultation to determine the

learning project that will be used through problem analysis is a systems approach taken to design a learning design (Keller, 2009).

Determining Learning Design

In the second stage, after determining the theme, the project is to strengthen the profile of Pancasila students. Ladies and gentlemen, the teacher council determines the desired learning design. This is in line with the five dimensions of multicultural education developed by James A. Banks (Banks, 1993; Banks & Banks, 2019), namely content integration (integrating various cultures and groups), the knowledge construction process (building a new knowledge construction), an equity pedagogy (equal pedagogy that facilitates academic achievement students who are diverse in terms of race, culture or social strata), prejudice reduction (reducing prejudice) and an empowering school culture (empowering school culture and social structure).

If mapped in more detail, the pattern of tolerance education taught at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean through PAI learning design also contains the value of content integration (integrating various cultures and religious groups in the surrounding environment), the knowledge construction process (building a new knowledge construction by conducting dialogue with several religious figures around the community), an equity pedagogy (equal pedagogy, namely facilitating the academic achievement of students who are diverse in terms of race, religious culture or social strata) prejudice reduction (reducing prejudice towards members of different beliefs) and an empowering school culture (empowering school culture and social structure).

Gagne explained that learning designs are designed to help students' learning process. With the PAI learning design, it is hoped that it will make it easier for students to understand the material on religious tolerance (Gagne, Wager, Golas, Keller, & Russell, 2005).

Forming a Learning Group

In stage three, after the teacher finds the right learning design with the project theme, the teacher forms a group. This was also explained by Mr. Lukman Hakim as an Islamic Religious Education teacher in class 11 science, he said that:

“There are ten groups consisting of five science class groups, four social studies class groups, and one language class group. In each class, on average, there are 2 to 3 non-Muslim students. This group activity aims to teach students an attitude of mutual respect and appreciation as well as clarifying the material on religious tolerance to grade 11 students directly by exploring data on several religious figures around the school and community environment.”

This is in line with what was conveyed by Siti Nur Asiyah, Asrul Anan in her journal that it is not enough for students to just memorize a theory or definition, but students must also apply abstract theories into concrete evidence of actions in the teaching and learning process of tolerance education in learning. Islamic education.

Therefore, the emergence of a PAI learning design which is packaged in the form of group assignments aims to provide direct understanding through observation activities, analyzing data on several religious figures, and so that students are able to apply theory into concrete evidence of actions and attitudes in society (Faozan, 2020).

Make learning activity reports

In stage four the teacher makes a report to the school head as approval for project activities. After the project activities are approved by the school principal, the teacher

begins implementing the learning design in learning, in this case the PAI learning design.

Implementation of PAI Learning Design

After the planning stage is carried out, the process of implementing the learning design can be carried out. In this stage, the process of implementing PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean will be explained. 1) In the first stage, the teacher delivers material related to religious tolerance in chapter 11 of the even semester. 2) The second stage the teacher conveys the learning objectives to be achieved. 3) The third stage the teacher conveys the learning design to students. 4) In the fourth stage the teacher conveys the group divisions. 5) The fifth stage the teacher delivers the assignment. 6) In the sixth stage, students analyze data through direct observation of community leaders based on instructions from the teacher. 7) In the seventh stage, students present the findings and create a scientific work in the form of a paper based on the findings.

All stages carried out by teachers in the process of implementing PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean are in accordance with the Islamic religious education learning indicators presented by Nik Bio in the book *Islamic Education*, among the indicators are (Supriati, 2018): Attracting attention, Conveying learning objectives, Improving concepts or principles that have been studied, Delivering learning material, Providing learning guidance, Obtaining student performance or appearance, Providing value for learning outcomes by giving tests, Strengthening retention and transfer of learning.

Based on the results of interviews with three samples of Muslim and non-Muslim students, they were very enthusiastic and interested in the PAI learning design. According to Laurent, one of the class Based on the results of observations, the researcher also saw and listened to the teacher conveying the objectives and material about tolerance, explaining the learning design and providing guidance to students, conducting evaluations and reflections at the end of the lesson (Aslaksen & Lorås, 2019; Firdaus, Jamal, & Arifin, 2023). This shows that in implementing the PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, Islamic religious education learning indicators have been met.

Evaluation of PAI Learning Design Implementation

In every program and activity there is of course an evaluation, as well as the implementation of PAI learning designs at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean. The teacher as the implementer of implementing the PAI learning design carries out an evaluation. The evaluation is carried out to determine whether the level of success that the students have achieved is in accordance with the expected goals or not (Faraji, Ezadpour, Rahrovi Dastjerdi, & Dolatzarei, 2022). In this research, the results of implementing the learning design are students' ability to understand religious tolerance material, students' attitudes in dealing with different religious environments, and the results of students' scientific work related to the results of observations made (Wiewiora & Kowalkiewicz, 2019).

Meanwhile, there are two evaluations or assessments carried out, namely group assessment and individual assessment, individual assessment is in the form of cognitive and attitude assessment, while group assessment is the result of scientific work in the form of a paper (Guangul, Suhail, Khalit, & Khidhir, 2020). The evaluation stage of the implementation of learning design in this research was carried out by the teacher in

observing and evaluating the results of learning activities, observing each learning process and presentation process carried out by students and assessing the results of students' scientific work through the papers that had been made, then conducting reflection sessions, namely lead activities. feedback made by students to their teacher, by providing impressions and messages regarding the learning experience provided by the teacher.

After reflecting on learning, all parties involved are expected to be able to apply the new knowledge gained in daily life consistently. To find out the effectiveness and value of implementing PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean, evaluation is an important thing that must be carried out. This confirms the theory presented by Wand and Gerald W. Brown which states that evaluation is an action to determine a value.

Setelah melakukan refleksi pembelajaran, semua pihak yang terkait diharap mampu mengaplikasikan ilmu baru yang didapat dalam kehidupan sehari-hari secara konsisten. Untuk mengetahui ke efektifitasan dan nilai dari penerapan desain pembelajaran PAI dalam mengembangkan toleransi beragama di SMA Negeri 1 Kedamean maka evaluasi menjadi hal penting yang harus dilaksanakan. Hal tersebut menguatkan teori yang disampaikan oleh Wand dan Gerald W. Brown yang menyatakan bahwa evaluasi adalah tindakan untuk menentukan suatu nilai (Hamalik, 2003).

CONCLUSION

Religious tolerance education needs to be given to students as early as possible. Instilling openness of thought from an early age, accepting differences, and maintaining harmony, based on the values of tolerance can minimize attitudes of intolerance in students. Especially in PAI learning in high school in grade 11 because there is material about "Tolerance as a Tool for Unifying the Nation" in the even semester. Teachers are required to be creative in developing learning media, learning designs, and learning methods used so that students can be interested and enthusiastic about participating in PAI learning.

The implementation of PAI learning design in developing religious tolerance at SMA I Negeri 1 Kedamean is divided into three stages, namely planning, implementation, and evaluation. This research confirms several previous studies and contributes a perspective (new point of view) regarding PAI learning design in senior high schools and equivalent. However, this research is only limited to PAI learning designs in developing religious tolerance, so further research is needed that discusses other learning designs to accommodate more varied cases or larger samples to obtain a better and more comprehensive design.

REFERENCES

- Alawi, H., & Maarif, M. A. (2021). Implementasi Nilai Islam Moderat Melalui Pendidikan Berbasis Multikultural. *Journal of Research and Thought on Islamic Education*, 4(2), 214–230. <https://doi.org/10.24260/jrtie.v4i2.2037>
- Álvarez, R. P., Jivet, I., Pérez-Sanagustín, M., Scheffel, M., & Verbert, K. (2022). Tools Designed to Support Self-Regulated Learning in Online Learning Environments: A Systematic Review. *IEEE Transactions on Learning Technologies*, 15(4), 508–522. <https://doi.org/10.1109/TLT.2022.3193271>
- Amirudin, J., Ruswandi, U., Erihadiana, M., & Rohimah, E. (2022a). Implementation of The CTL Learning Model Through Islamic Moderate Values in Improving the Attitude of Students

Implementation of PAI Learning Design in Developing Religious Tolerance in Public High Schools

- Tolerance in School. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(2), 690–703. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i2.2201>
- Amirudin, J., Ruswandi, U., Erihadiana, M., & Rohimah, E. (2022b). Implementation of The CTL Learning Model Through Islamic Moderate Values in Improving the Attitude of Students Tolerance in School. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(2), 690–703. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i2.2201>
- Anwar, K. (2021). Pancasila Village, Multicultural Education and Moderation of Diversity in Indonesia. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(2), 221–234.
- Apriliani, I., & Justitia, T. (2021). The Implementation of Islamic Education in Muslim Minority Area. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 4(2), 150–161. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v4i2.1224>
- Asiyah, S. N., & Anan Asrul. (2021). Pola Dan Proses Pendidikan Toleransi Dalam Pembentukan Sikap Toleransi Siswa Antar Umat Beragama Di Smkn Tukur. *Multicultural of Islamic Education*, 01(1), 55–62.
- Aslaksen, K., & Lorås, H. (2019). Matching Instruction with Modality-Specific Learning Style: Effects on Immediate Recall and Working Memory Performance. *Education Sciences*, 9(1), 32. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci9010032>
- Banks, J. A. (1993). Multicultural Education: Historical Development, Dimensions, and Practice. *Review of Research in Education*, 19, 3–49. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1167339>
- Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (2019). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Børte, K., Nesje, K., & Lillejord, S. (2023). Barriers to student active learning in higher education. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 28(3), 597–615. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2020.1839746>
- Dick, W. (1996). The dick and carey model: Will it survive the decade? *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 44(3), 55–63. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02300425>
- Faozan, A. (2020). Moderasi Beragama Dalam Pendidikan Agama Islam Untuk Masyarakat Multikultur. *Hikmah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 16(2), 219–228. <https://doi.org/10.47466/hikmah.v16i2.170>
- Faraji, O., Ezadpour, M., Rahrovi Dastjerdi, A., & Dolatzarei, E. (2022). Conceptual structure of balanced scorecard research: A co-word analysis. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 94(October), 102128. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2022.102128>
- Firdaus, M. A., Jamal, M. Y. S., & Arifin, B. S. (2023). Improving Student Learning Outcomes Through Project-Based Learning in Islamic Religion Lessons. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 4(2), 241–254. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i2.400>
- Fuadi, A., Nasution, W. N., & Wijaya, C. (2023). Management of Teacher Professionalism Development: A Multi-Site Study of State Madrasah Aliyah in Langkat Regency. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education*, 4(1), 180–199. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i1.444>
- Gagne, R. M., Wager, W. W., Golas, K. C., Keller, J. M., & Russell, J. D. (2005). Principles of instructional design, 5th edition. *Performance Improvement*, 44(2), 44–46. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pfi.4140440211>
- Guangul, F. M., Suhail, A. H., Khalit, M. I., & Khidhir, B. A. (2020). Challenges of remote assessment in higher education in the context of COVID-19: A case study of Middle East College. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 32(4), 519–535. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11092-020-09340-w>
- Habermas, J. (2004). Religious Tolerance – The Pacemaker for Cultural Rights. *Philosophy*, 79(1), 5–18. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0031819104000026>
- Halim, A. (2022). Sikap Multikultural Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam di Sekolah. *Andragogi: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 2(1), 48–59.
- Hamalik, O. (2003). *Perencanaan pengajaran berdasarkan pendekatan sistem*. Bumi Aksara.
- Jayadi, K., Abduh, A., & Basri, M. (2022). A meta-analysis of multicultural education paradigm in Indonesia. *Heliyon*, 8(1), e08828. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e08828>

- Keller, J. M. (2009). *Motivational Design for Learning and Performance: The ARCS Model Approach*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Ma`arif, M. A. (2019). Internalisasi Nilai Multikultural Dalam Mengembangkan Sikap Toleransi (Studi Di Di Pesantren Mahasiswa Universitas Islam Malang). *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 2(1), 164–189. <https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v2i1.179>
- Menon, S., Kars, M. C., Malhotra, C., Campbell, A. V., & van Delden, J. J. M. (2018). Advance Care Planning in a Multicultural Family Centric Community: A Qualitative Study of Health Care Professionals', Patients', and Caregivers' Perspectives. *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management*, 56(2), 213–221.e4. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2018.05.007>
- Mulyasa, E. (2013). *Pengembangan dan implementasi kurikulum 2013*. PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Munif, K. A. dan. (2019). Strategi Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam Dalam Membangun Toleransi Kerukunan Beragama Bagi Siswa. *Multicultural of Islamic Education*, 2(2), 1–13.
- Nakaya, A. (2018). Overcoming Ethnic Conflict through Multicultural Education: The Case of West Kalimantan, Indonesia. *International Journal of Multicultural Education*, 20(1), 118–137. <https://doi.org/10.18251/ijme.v20i1.1549>
- Ni Putu Alit Wulandari, I Gede Suwindia, I. K. S. (2019). Bentuk Toleransi Antarumat Beragama Pada Siswa. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 2, 134–160.
- Nurbatra, L. H., & Masyhud, M. (2022). Infusing Culturally Responsive Teaching in Higher Education: Insights for Multicultural Education in Indonesia. *Journal of Innovation in Educational and Cultural Research*, 3(4), 722–730. <https://doi.org/10.46843/jiecr.v3i4.321>
- Observasi. (n.d.). Gresik, 15 Mei 2023.
- Ok, A. H., Al-Farabi, M., & Firmansyah, F. (2022). Internalization of Multicultural Islamic Education Values In High School Students. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 3(3), 221–228. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v3i3.265>
- Raihani. (2012). Report on multicultural education in pesantren. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 42(4), 585–605. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2012.672255>
- Rofi'ah, E. A. (2018). *Implementasi Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Menumbuhkan Budaya Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama*.
- Rohmah, H., Rena, S., Pahrurraji, P., & Syarif, F. (2023). Implementation of Multicultural Education Values in Senior High School. *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal*, 2(2), 78–94. <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v2i2.29>
- Romadlan, S. (2019). Toleransi Terhadap Non-Muslim Dalam Pemahaman Organisasi Islam Muhammadiyah dan Nahdlatul Ulama (NU). *Sahafa Journal of Islamic Communication*, 1(2), 103. <https://doi.org/10.21111/sjic.v1i2.2740>
- Sechandini, R. A., Ratna, R. D., Zakariyah, Z., & Na'imah, F. U. (2023). Multicultural-Based Learning of Islamic Religious Education for the Development of Students' Social Attitudes. *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal*, 2(2), 106–117. <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v2i2.27>
- Sugiyono. (2018). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sukmadinata, N. S. (2005). *Metode penelitian pendidikan*. Program Pascasarjana Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia dengan PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Supriati, P. (2018). Pengembangan instrumen pengukuran toleransi pada mahasiswa sekolah menengah pertama. *Wiyata Dharma: Jurnal Penelitian Dan Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 6(2), 117.
- Uyun, M., & Warsah, I. (2022). Prospective Teachers' Intercultural Sensitivity alongside the Contextual Factors as the Affective Domain to Realize Multicultural Education. *International Journal of Instruction*, 15, 555–576. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2022.15430a>
- Wiewiora, A., & Kowalkiewicz, A. (2019). The role of authentic assessment in developing authentic leadership identity and competencies. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, 44(3), 415–430. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2018.1516730>